UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY

Guide for Providing Evidence of Teaching
September, 2018

Natasha Kenny, Carol Berenson, Scott Radford, Nickie Nikolaou, Wendy Benoit, Robin Mueller, Robyn Paul, & Ellen Perrault

This document provides a guide to help you identify and record the various elements of your teaching and learning practices. You may find it helpful when preparing materials that require you to describe your teaching practice and impact (such as academic hiring processes, teaching dossiers and teaching award nomination packages) or for identifying activities you would like to pursue to enhance your teaching practice. It has been developed based on the *Teaching Expertise Framework* (Kenny et al., 2017).

Please Note: This is **not** a checklist, and not every facet or category may be relevant to your practice. The guide simply lists items you may want to include and ways in which you can document them. You may find some categories could indicate overlap – for each piece of evidence, you can choose the most relevant category given your particular context.

Facets of Teaching Expertise and Examples of Supporting Evidence

Teaching and Supporting Learning	
Teaching that places learning at its centre involves creating experiences and environments that empower students to engage, learn deeply, and become self-directed learners (Trigwell, Prosser & Waterhouse, 1999; Weimer, 2013). Teaching organized around student learning also recognizes that understanding and improving learning is an ongoing process, hence, teaching expertise is developed over time and always evolving (Hendry & Dean, 2002; Kreber, 2002). A commitment to setting clear expectations for both teaching and learning, regularly providing and gathering feedback, and critically reflecting on one's teaching practice and philosophy guides practitioners in a learning-focused teaching framework (Lizzio, Wilson & Simons, 2002; Nichol & Macfarlene-Dick, 2006; Tigelaar et. al, 2002).	
Example Activities	***Examples of Evidence***
- Reflects on the teaching and learning approaches that are typically used in one's discipline - Explores the process of placing student learning at the centre of one's teaching activities - Recognizes that there are multiple ways to design learning experiences and engage with students - Recognizes that teaching expertise is developmental in nature - Reads about teaching and learning approaches and activities	**Evidence from Self:** - Teaching philosophy statement. One to two pages describing what you believe about teaching and student learning, why you hold these beliefs, and brief highlights of how you put them into practice. - List of teaching roles and responsibilities (overview of courses taught --title, description, enrollment, graduate/undergraduate, required/elective; practica; clinical teaching). - Selected course materials such as: a description of an innovative teaching activity or approach (i.e.: inquiry-based, experiential learning); an informal survey designed to collect feedback on a novel teaching activity; a lesson plan for an interactive class; an excerpt from a course outline; an assignment description; a grading rubric; a learning resource and/or materials.

- Tries new teaching and learning approaches and activities - Intentionally aligns course components (i.e., learning goals, learning activities, assessment strategies) - Develops educational experiences with a range of learners in mind - Designs participatory learning activities - Encourages students to apply their learning in novel contexts - Designs assessment strategies that provide clear criteria and timely feedback - Establishes appropriate course workload requirements to challenge students while ensuring adequate time and support - Collects feedback at various times from a variety of sources - Uses student feedback to adjust teaching practices - Develops a teaching philosophy - Shares teaching philosophy with colleagues and students - Begins to gather evidence for a dossier that documents one's effectiveness and growth - Creates opportunities for students to become aware of the conditions that best support their learning - Engages students as collaborators or partners in the classroom (e.g., includes students in course and assignment design) - Formally and informally shares course materials and teaching approaches with colleagues - Situates their courses within broader curriculum planning processes	- Reflections on your teaching, including evidence collected from students and colleagues. How these strategies and supporting material link back to your teaching philosophy, what they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what you've learned and how you will continue to grow and improve. - Short and long-term teaching goals. **Evidence from Students:** - Summative Student ratings of instruction/USRI or other course evaluation data (qualitative and quantitative). - Intentional formative/midterm feedback collected from students. - Formal Faculty feedback/evaluation form data (e.g. student comments). - Samples of student work (e.g. exemplars, successive drafts). - Student achievements directly related to your teaching and learning activities (i.e.: career placement, grad school admission, publications, presentations). - Teaching awards received from student bodies (e.g. Student Union Teaching Awards). - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific teaching practices and/or impact. - Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship). **Evidence from Colleagues/Peers:** - Teaching observation documents (e.g. Teaching Squares). - Records from formal or informal review of course materials from peers. - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from colleagues that speak directly to specific teaching practices and/or impact. - Letters of support from colleagues. - Teaching awards (title, description, nomination process, and criteria of award). - Invitations to teach. - Peer-reviewed publications related to teaching and learning. - Peer feedback from clinical practicum and/or preceptorship feedback. - Cooperative (Coop) work placement supervisor feedback regarding student learning and development

Supervision and Mentorship

Supervision or mentorship is characterized as a positive, respectful, mutually-beneficial relationship that supports the teaching and academic development of both mentor and mentee (Mathias, 2005). Mentoring relationships foster self-exploration, career advancement, intellectual development, enhanced confidence and competence, social and emotional support, academic citizenship and socialization, information sharing, and professional identity formation (Johnson, 2007; Schlosser et al., 2011; Foote and Solem, 2009). Mentorship typically occurs between an experienced faculty member and a less experienced colleague, student or postdoctoral scholar, but can also occur in a group context (Phillips, Dennison, Cox, 2015). Developed formally (i.e. structured programs) or informally, mentorship focuses on topics most relevant to the mentor and mentee. Supervisors are mentors and more. "Supervisor" means a qualified individual, who is normally an Academic Staff Member, who serves as the primary mentor to a Graduate Student, oversees the Graduate Student's academic progress, and serves as chair of the Graduate Student's supervisory committee, where applicable (University of Calgary Calendar). Supervision is a professional relationship which includes an aspect of accountability for both supervisor and supervisee. Supervisors not only provide academic supervision (research and writing), they are also expected to mentor students in career development (securing funding, dissemination, professional and collaborative skills) (CAGS, 2008).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
- Recognizes value of mentorship as a relational and reciprocal process - Identifies areas where mentorship is needed for one's own growth and development - Explores mentoring opportunities and resources - Seeks mentorship in a variety of contexts - Builds a mentorship network - Develops rapport, trust, and respect with mentors - Engages with mentors regularly - Reflects on and documents the influence of mentorship in one's professional growth - Collaborates on specific teaching and learning activities with a mentor - Becomes a mentor for others - Develops a mentorship identity and philosophy that reflects the reciprocity of mentoring relationships - As a mentor, facilitates dialogue, outwardly encourages others, shares advice and resources, models, and promotes self-exploration and growth with mentees - Initiates discussion about academic culture, governance, politics, and institutional processes through mentorship	**Evidence from Self:** - Supervision and mentorship philosophy statement, including connections with teaching philosophy. - List of undergraduate and graduate students and post-doctoral scholars formally supervised or mentored and a description of roles/responsibilities. - List of undergraduate and graduate students and post-doctoral scholars informally supervised or mentored and a description of roles/responsibilities supervision and mentoring outside of a course (e.g., students seeking advice, job searches, graduate applications, community activities, student club activities, reference letters, etc.). - Description of mentorship provided *for* peers (e.g., discussing teaching approaches, reviewing and sharing course outlines, course materials, etc.). - Description of mentorship sought out and obtained *from* peers (e.g., asking for advice on evaluation methods, course content, approaches, etc.). - Presentations/publications on supervision or mentoring. - Support to students for presentations and publications (scholarship). - Self-developed mentorship/supervision structures, frameworks, or processes. - Written agreements made with students to support mentorship and supervision activities (e.g. monthly meetings, regular feedback, setting timelines). - Reflections on your mentorship and supervision and other evidence (i.e. evidence from students and colleagues). How these strategies and supporting material link back to your supervision philosophy, what they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what you've learned and how you will continue to grow and improve.

- Creates departmental or group mentorship programs, networks, and communities - Develops and creates mentorship resources for others - Demonstrates being accessible to supervised students - Ensures regular monitoring and feedback for supervisees	**Evidence from Students:** - Comments made about supervision/mentoring activities on formal evaluations (if applicable). - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific supervision and mentorship practices and/or impact. - Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship). - Information about student activities and achievements related to your supervision and mentoring (e.g., job placement, graduate school admission, events organized, presentations made). **Evidence from Colleagues/Peers:** - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from colleagues that speak directly to specific supervision and mentorship practices and/or impact. - Letters of support from colleagues. - List and description of awards received for mentorship and supervision. - Requests to review course materials, give mentorship feedback/advice on teaching activities. - Requests from broader community to mentor for specific teaching and learning resources and/or support.

Professional Learning & Development

Professional learning and development of practice is a key component of expert practice and contributes to teacher reflective practice. Reflective practice and participation in formal and informal professional development is linked to improved student learning outcomes and engagement as well as improved experiences for teachers (Carmichael, 2012). Professional development includes engaging in formal processes such as conferences, seminars, or workshops, courses or programs on teaching and learning, and collaborative learning among members of a community. Professional learning can also occur in informal contexts such as discussions among work colleagues, independent reading and research, observations of a colleague's work, or other learning from a peer (Arthur, 2016).

Example Activities	Examples of Evidence
- Identifies potential professional learning opportunities - Identifies learning interests / topics / themes - Recognizes that professional learning and development is ongoing throughout one's career - Engages in professional learning opportunities (e.g., conferences, workshops, communities of practice, teaching/facilitation square, facilitation/coaching development opportunities) - Critically reflects on and documents professional learning and development (e.g., in discussions with colleagues, to self-assess, to incorporate into practice, to include in annual reviews, tenure and promotion processes, awards, teaching portfolios) - Applies learning to practice and critically reflects on that experience - Discusses learning with others - Designs, develops, and implements professional learning opportunities for colleagues - Contributes to professional learning of others (e.g., offers workshops, forums, facilitates communities of practice) - Contributes to and advances the knowledge and practice of professional learning to the broader educational community	**Evidence From Self:** - Documentation of participation in teaching and learning workshops, courses (credit or non-credit), programs, mentorship, and communities of practice - Products or documents related to professional learning activities (e.g. outcomes from a community of practice) - Details of courses, workshops, and activities designed and delivered to peers (e.g number of attendees, level of involvement, goal, whether it was departmental, faculty, university-wide, regional, national or international). - Reflection on why you engaged in professional learning, what you learned and how you incorporated this into your teaching practice, and how these learnings have influenced your beliefs about teaching and learning. Reflection aligning professional development activities with evidence from students. - Semester/annual reflective memo. Reflection on learning, strengths and areas for growth. - Professional development goals (short and longterm). **Evidence From Students:** - Student comments that relate to practices that you implemented from professional learning activities. **Evidence From Colleagues/Peers:** - Peer comments that relate to practices that you implemented from professional learning activities. - Letters of support from colleagues (e.g. reflections on what they have learned from you). - Documents and feedback from peer teaching observations or teaching squares.

Educational Leadership

Educational leaders influence change and implement initiatives to strengthen teaching and learning practices, communities, and cultures (Keppell, O'Wyer, Lyon & Childs, 2010; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016). They share their expertise to inspire and help others strengthen their teaching practices; implement strategic programs, initiatives and policies to improve teaching and student learning; advocate for positive change; and lead institutions, faculties and committees to continuously improve postsecondary education (Creanor, 2014; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016; Taylor, 2005). Educational leadership is demonstrated through formal leadership roles (e.g. Committee Chairs, Department Heads), structures and responsibilities, and through leadership activities that may not be formally identified as part of one's teaching responsibilities (Creanor, 2014; Jones, Lefoe, Harvey & Ryland, 2012; Mårtensson & Roxa, 2016).

Example Activities	*Examples of Evidence*

- Identifies opportunities to participate in governance processes that relate to teaching and learning
- Aligns one's teaching and curriculum to support institutional, program, and departmental priorities
- Participates in governance committees, working groups, and processes related to teaching and learning (e.g., members of teaching and learning committees, curriculum review committees, appeals panels)
- Participates in policy development, implementation, and/or evaluation surrounding teaching and learning
- Brings forward issues as feedback to improve program, department, or institutional teaching and learning approaches, communities, and contexts
- Participates in institutional processes, surveys, and strategy sessions related to teaching and learning
- Leads development and implementation of teaching and learning initiatives at a variety of levels (e.g. departmental, faculty, university, national, international)
- Creates and leads initiatives to help colleagues strengthen their teaching practices
- Creates and leads opportunities for colleagues to network and share experiences, and for
	Evidence From Self:
	- Description of engagement in institutional processes and strategy/planning sessions related to teaching and learning.
	- Description of initiatives developed and or led to help enable other instructors' growth as educators (e.g. workshops, communities of practice, reading groups, journal clubs, lunch and learns). Note: instructors may include peers, teaching assistants, postdoctoral scholars or other members of instructional teams.
	  ▪ Examples or excerpts from learning materials from these initiatives that demonstrate your beliefs about educational leadership, i.e. Artifacts – facilitation plans, planning documents.
	- Description of formal or informal mentorship of peers, teaching assistants or other members of instructional teams.
	- Description of contributions to teaching and learning committees, working groups, task forces/curriculum committees at various levels, including leadership roles.
	  ▪ Example outcomes from your leadership and work on committees and working groups related to teaching and learning (e.g. policy, resource development, reports).
	- Description of formal educational leadership roles (e.g. Associate Dean Teaching & Learning, Associate Dean Undergrad, Department Head).
	- List and description of invitations to speak at local, national or international conferences/events related to educational leadership.
	- Philosophy statement that describes your beliefs about educational leadership, and description of your educational leadership approaches.
	- Description of accepted invitations to consult on, review, or contribute to the development of internal or external academic programs.
	- Description of accepted invitations to act as a visiting teaching and learning scholar at another institution.

communities of practice to develop (e.g., journal clubs, online collaborations, in person networks) - Holds formal leadership roles that advance teaching and learning (e.g., committees, curricular reviews, working groups) - Facilitates planning related to teaching and learning - Formally and informally shares course materials and teaching approaches with colleagues - Situates their courses within broader curriculum planning processes	- Reflection on how your educational leadership contributions relate back to your teaching philosophy, your strengths, what you have learned, and how you hope to further grow and develop. **Evidence From Students:** - Evaluation data (e.g. student engagement data, retention or admission rates) that relate to your educational leadership contributions. - Letters of support from former students that speak to your educational leadership activities (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship). - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from learners that speak directly to specific educational leadership practices and/or impact. **Evidence From Colleagues/Peers:** - Teaching and learning workshop participation and evaluation data, including qualitative comments. - Example assessment reports from external accreditation or program review committees. - Letters of support from colleagues, senior administrators or collaborators that speak to your educational leadership contributions and impact. - Letters of support from Committee/Working Group members that speak to your educational leadership contributions and impact. - Local or national press coverage related to educational leadership initiatives. - Awards received that relate to your educational leadership contributions.

Research, Scholarship, & Inquiry
One way in which teaching expertise is both developed and expressed is through research, scholarship, and inquiry--terms that reflect the variations of this activity across different contexts (Poole, 2013). Teaching and learning have a complex relationship that invites teachers to develop "pedagogical content knowledge" (Shulman, 1986), or an understanding of how learning happens (or doesn't) within specific disciplines and subject areas. Research, scholarship, and inquiry play a key role in developing this knowledge. Expert teachers consult relevant existing research to build a strong foundation for designing, implementing, and assessing effective learning experiences for students (Shulman, 2004). Expert teachers may also conduct and share their own pedagogical research, scholarship, or inquiry not only to advance their own understanding, but also to contribute to the larger body of knowledge about effective teaching and learning (Felten 2013; Shulman, 1993).

Example Activities	**Examples of Evidence**
- Identifies curiosities about teaching and student learning - Becomes aware of teaching and learning research and discipline-based educational research literature - Identifies people to have conversations with about teaching and learning scholarship and research - Reads and reflects on the literature on teaching and learning - Applies SoTL and discipline-based educational research to improve one's teaching practice and students' learning - Asks questions about one's students' learning and its relationship to teaching - Collects evidence of students' learning - Participates in local conferences and events to share knowledge related to teaching and learning - Engages in research, scholarship, and inquiry with peers - Assesses the efficacy of high-impact teaching and learning practices - Develops approaches to teaching that are informed by research, critical reflection (e.g., examining one's own context and assumptions), and discussions with peers	**Evidence From Self:** - Self-reflective comments or artifacts that connect choices within one's teaching practice to findings in discipline based education research (DBER) and/or SoTL literature. - Documentation of course materials that reflect teaching and learning research. - Description of teaching and learning research projects and/or teaching and learning grants received, connecting these to teaching and learning literature and one's professional development. - Listing involvement (participation, presentation) in non-peer reviewed events where teaching and learning research ideas are discussed with colleagues. - Editor or peer reviewer for teaching and learning, scholarship of teaching and learning or discipline-based educational research publication. - List and description of teaching and learning grants received. - List and description collaborative partnerships and research projects initiated. - Future goals related to teaching and learning research, scholarship, and inquiry. - Reflections on your teaching and learning research, and other evidence (i.e. evidence from students and colleagues). How these strategies and supporting material link back to your teaching philosophy, what they say about your strengths and accomplishments, what you've learned and how you will continue to grow and improve. **Evidence From Students:** - Summary of quantitative and/or quantative data collected as part of a systematic inquiry to inform one's teaching. - Themes in student data and feedback that characterize students' learning experiences. - Description and documentation of ethical research/scholarly/inquiry strategies for providing a variety of student feedback and data on their learning (e.g. focus groups, surveys, setting up students as representatives to provide a formal lens to provide feedback).

- Contributes to the knowledge and practices of the broader academic community (e.g., conference presentations, publications) to expand and advance the practice and scholarship of teaching and learning	- Selective and purposeful informal feedback from students who have been involved in scholarly teaching projects (e.g. peer mentors; TAs or research assistants hired to work on development projects). - Letters of support from former students (no longer teaching or in a supervisory relationship) commenting on how their involvement in scholarly teaching project experiences has affected their learning and growth. **Evidence From Colleagues/Peers:** - Peer-reviewed publications and presentations related to inquiry and scholarship in teaching and learning (e.g. SoTL, DBER). - Invitation to speak on teaching and learning research topic. - Evidence of impact on peers' scholarship (citations, others' application of one's SoTL and/or DBER contributions). - Selective and purposeful informal feedback from peers that speak to your contributions related to inquiry, research and scholarship in teaching and learning. - Letters from colleagues/peers that speak to your contributions related to inquiry, research and scholarship in teaching and learning.

References:

Arthur, L. (2016). Communities of practice in higher education: professional learning in an academic career. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 21(3): 230-241.

Canadian Association of Graduate Studies (CAGS) (2008) Guiding Principles for Graduate Student Supervision. Retrieved from: https://cags.ca/documents/publications/working/Guiding%20Principles%20for%20Graduate%20Student%20Supervision%20in%20Canada%20-%20rvsn7.pdf

Carmichael, D. L., and Martens, R.P. (2012). Midwestern Magic: Iowa's Statewide Initiative Engages Teachers, Encourages Leadership, and Energizes Student Learning. *Journal of Staff Development* 33(3): 22-26.

Creanor, L. (2014). Raising the profile: An institutional case study of embedding scholarship and innovation through distributive leadership. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 51(6), 573-583.

Felten, P. (2013). Principles of good practice in SoTL. *Teaching & Learning Inquiry, 1*(1). 121-125.

Foote, K.E. & Solem, M.N. (2009) Toward better mentoring for early career faculty: results of a study of US geographers. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 14(1), 47-58.

Hendry, G.D. & Dean, S.J. 2002. Accountability, evaluation and teaching expertise in higher education. *International Journal of Academic Development, 7*(1), 75-82.

Johnson, B. (2007) Transformational supervision: When supervisors mentor. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 38 (3), 259-267.

Jones, S., Lefoe, G., Harvey, M., & Ryland, K. (2012). Distributed leadership: A collaborative framework for academics, executives and professionals in higher education. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 34(1), 67-78.

Kenny, N., Berenson, C., Chick, N., Johnson, C., Keegan, D., Read, E., Reid, L. (2017, October). A Developmental Framework for Teaching Expertise in Postsecondary Education. Poster presented at the International Society for the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Conference, Calgary, Alberta, Canada. Retrieved from: http://connections.ucalgaryblogs.ca/2017/11/04/developing-a-learning-culture-a-framework-for-the-growth-of-teaching-expertise/

Keppell, M., O'Dwyer, C., Lyon, B., & Childs, M. (2011). Transforming distance education curricula through distributive leadership. *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks,* 15(4), 9-21.

Kreber, C. (2002). Teaching excellence, teaching expertise, and the scholarship of teaching. *Innovative Higher Education*, 27(1), 5-23.

Lizzio, A., Wilson, K., & Simons, R. (2002). University students' perceptions of the learning environment and academic outcomes: implications for theory and practice. *Studies in Higher education*, *27*(1), 27-52.

Nicol, D. J., & Macfarlane-Dick, D. (2006). Formative assessment and self-regulated learning: A model and seven principles of good feedback practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, *31*(2), 199-218.

Mathias, H. (2005) Mentoring on a programme for new university teachers: a partnership in revitalizing and empowering collegiality. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 10(2): 95-106.

Mårtensson, K., & Roxå, T. (2016). Leadership at a local level–Enhancing educational development. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 44(2), 247-262.

Phillips, S. L., Dennison, S. T., Cox, M. (2015). *Faculty Mentoring: A Practical Manual for Mentors, Mentees, Administrators, and Faculty Developers.* Herndon, US: Stylus Publishing. Retrieved from http://www.ebrary.com

Poole, G. (2013). Square one: What is research? In K. McKinney (Ed.), *The scholarship of teaching and learning in and across the disciplines*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press. 135-151.

Shulman, L.S. (2004). Lamarck's revenge: teaching among the scholarships. *Teaching as Community Property: Essays on Higher Education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. 164-172.

Shulman, L.S. (1993). Teaching as community property: putting an end to pedagogical solitude. *Change, 25*(6). 6-7.

Schlosser, L.Z., Lyons, H.Z., Talleyrand, R.M., Kim, B.S.K., & Johnson, W.B. (2011) Advisor-advisee relationships in graduate training programs. *Journal of Career Development*, 38(1), 3-18.

Taylor, K. L. (2005). Academic development as institutional leadership: An interplay of person, role, strategy, and institution. *International Journal for Academic Development*, 10(1), 31-46.

Tigelaar, D.E.H, Dolmans, D.H.J.M, Wolfhagen, I.H.A.P, and Van Der Vleuten, C.P.M. (2004) The development and validation of a framework for teaching competencies in higher education. *Higher Education*, 48, 253-268.

Trigwell, K., Prosser, M., & Waterhouse, F. (1999). Relations between teachers' approaches to teaching and students' approaches to learning. *Higher education*, 37(1), 57-70.

Weimer, M. (2013) *Learner-centred Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice*, Second Edition. Jossey-Bass.

Recommended citation:
Kenny, N., Berenson, C. Radford, S., Nikolaou, N., Benoit, W., Mueller, R., Paul, R. & Perrault, E. (2018). *A Guide to Providing Evidence of Teaching*. Calgary, AB: University of Calgary.